

MICHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY

The African e-Journals Project has digitized full text of articles of eleven social science and humanities journals. This item is from the digital archive maintained by Michigan State University Library. Find more at:

<http://digital.lib.msu.edu/projects/africanjournals/>

Available through a partnership with



Scroll down to read the article.

BOOK REVIEWS

Seretse Khama, 1921–1980 by Neil Parsons, Willie Henderson and Thomas Tlou. Macmillan, Gaborone, 1995, pp. 467, ISBN 0-7978-0580-X.

This book combines the labours of three historians and has taken many years in the writing and publishing. Yet it aims to 'read like higher journalism' and in this it admirably succeeds. One cannot tell where one author stops and another begins. Between them the three authors have achieved an easy, flowing and simple style, even when dealing with the complexities of Bangwato tribal politics. A good deal of it has a romantic and shocking story to tell — the marriage of Seretse and Ruth, and the extraordinarily cowardly and hypocritical response of both major British parties. But even when it comes to the less spectacular business of forming a national party and achieving independence — and in Botswana this *was* unspectacular — the narrative maintains its grip. Seldom has 397 pages passed so rapidly.

Nevertheless, all this ease and simplicity should not mislead. The biography may not be, as they assert, 'definitive', but it contains a great deal of fascinating and important material. It describes how Seretse, whose fame and legitimacy was derived from being the real Bangwato chief, chose to construct a national party and to sideline chiefs as a body. It describes how he believed in a 'cattle-owning democracy' without fully exploring the very substantial inequalities and repressions which are inherent within it. It describes how he was at least as much irritated by 'pushy' Kalanga self-assertion as was his formidable uncle, Tshekedi. Tshekedi had repressed claims for Kalanga autonomy and language use in the interests of the Bangwato tribal state. Seretse regarded Kalanga pretensions as a threat to the new Botswana nation. In all this, as in his reticence and abstention from rhetoric, Seretse set many of the patterns of contemporary Botswanan politics.

Much of the book relates to Rhodesian/Zimbabwean history. Here, too, there are some good anecdotes. The authors tell the story of how Seretse presided over the signing of a copper mining agreement between the Rhodesian Selection Trust and 'the tribe' on June 2, 1959 which was the first sign of Botswana's mineral revolution:

After the signing, Seretse invited the signatories up to his house on the hill for refreshments. The white Rhodesian managers of RST sat uneasily around the living room with drinks in hand, in what may have been their first ever venture in a black man's house. A group of Bangwato councillors arrived, standing quietly at a distance awaiting the customary permission to enter the yard. This gave rise to a typically wicked piece of Seretse humour, designed to disconcert his guests still further. He rose from his chair and walked to the screen-netting of the stoep, saying in a loud

aside to his friend David Robinson: 'I suppose I'd better tell those natives they are allowed inside.' The RST men hardly knew where to look.

Seretse's other interactions with White Rhodesians were less under his control. He felt a natural and justified indignation against British governments which first cravenly sought to propitiate Rhodesian Whites and then used Botswana as a base for radio broadcasting into rebel Rhodesia without bothering to seek permission to do so. But gradually Seretse was able to assert his own interests in handling the Rhodesian crisis. The book provides an unusual and fascinating perspective on the policy making of the front-line states. In most accounts it is almost forgotten that Botswana participated with Zambia, Mozambique and Tanzania. But here Seretse's calm personality emerges strongly amidst the more flamboyant characters of Nyerere, Kaunda and Machel.

When Seretse made a state visit to Malawi in July 1967 he was expected to play second fiddle to Banda:

When Seretse and Banda were driving in an open-topped vehicle through the streets of Zomba, Banda stood up to wave to the crowds. Seretse, as his guest, naturally did likewise. After a few moments Banda turned to Seretse and said: 'You can sit down now: they have come to see me. They don't know who you are.' Suitably chastened, Seretse sat down.

Ten years or so later, Seretse was not being taken for granted by anyone. After one disagreement between himself and Kaunda on one side and Nyerere and Machel on the other, Seretse expressed his anger when Kaunda backed down. 'You are a coward. You are too afraid of this Headman (Nyerere).' Nyerere himself came to appreciate Seretse's qualities, and the book ends with an 'Epilogue' which reproduces Nyerere's speech at the unveiling of a bronze statue of Seretse in September 1986.

Like so much Botswana historiography this is an account of a nation's past by means of the biography of a 'great man'. (In this case, of course, it is also the biography of a remarkable woman). Parsons himself has given memorable accounts of Khama the Great; Michael Crowder left an incomplete but remarkable study of Tshekedi Khama. Now we have this biography of Seretse, which could hardly have been better done. The definitive biography can wait awhile. Maybe the historians of Botswana will now be able to turn from chiefly lives to the many untreated questions which arise from the country's twentieth century economic and social history.

A Modern Economic History of Africa, Vol. 1: The Nineteenth Century
By *Tiyambe Zeleza*. Dakar, CODESRIA, 1993, viii, 501 pp., ISBN 2-86978-027-3.

This book won the 1994 Noma Award and was commended by the judges as 'an outstanding, pioneering work' which elevates 'the study of African economic history to a new pedestal'. It is an informative, scholarly and clearly written study which is a welcome and important contribution to the study of Africa's political economy in the 19th century.

The book comprises 15 chapters grouped into five parts, each dealing with a select theme. Part I, 'Environment and Demographic Change', examines the patterns of climatic change, the ecology of disease, demographic changes in the heyday of the Trans-Atlantic slave trade, the prevailing settlement patterns of the time and the ways in which African societies tried to cope with the problems of their time. This section not only argues persuasively for the importance of the role and impact of the environment and demographic changes on the African political economy but also presents an insightful critique of the way in which scholars have either misunderstood and misrepresented these forces or have dismissed them simply as background factors not worthy of serious analysis.

Under 'Agricultural Production' in Part II, the focus is on land use, relations of production, agricultural production and the early manifestations of European colonial agriculture in South Africa and the Portuguese territories of Angola and Mozambique. Part III focuses on mining and manufacturing and examines, not only the technologies and techniques used by African societies in developing their mining and manufacturing industries, but also the predominant relations of production in these sectors. Part IV concentrates on Africa's domestic and regional trade and points out that the over-simplification and generalisations of existing scholarship on the nature of Africa's pre-colonial trade cannot be justified because trade patterns were complex and varied considerably throughout the 19th century. In Part V an effort is made to document and analyse both the volume and nature of Africa's international trade and its relationship with late 19th century European imperialism.

A Modern Economic History of Africa's encyclopaedic wealth of facts and figures about Africa and its incisive criticism of a wide range of current scholarly writings on Africa's pre-colonial past is clear testimony to the author's familiarity, not only with his subject matter, but also with the existent scholarship on a wide range of subjects. Its 51-page bibliography is, perhaps, the most comprehensive and accessible record of published and unpublished materials on Africa's pre-colonial past available. In addition, the book offers a refreshingly frank, courageous and insightful critique of existing scholarship on Africa's pre-colonial experience, showing how certain myths and misconceptions, generated

and sustained by both Western and African scholars, have distorted the continent's past.

The book argues persuasively, for instance, against the prevailing trend of treating Sub-Saharan Africa as a separate entity from the rest of the continent and charges that this approach, which was born of 'European imperialist arrogance and racism' in the 19th century, is 'a racist construct intended to divorce North Africa from the mainstream of African history' (p. 2). It maintains that the three historical paradigms which have dominated analyses of the African past, namely the Neo-classical, Dependency and Marxist schools, have offered, at times, 'partial, and sometimes misleading, analyses of the process and content of economic change and development in Africa in the pre-colonial era' (p. 3) and, have, at other times, propagated 'myths and stereotypes' about the African past. The problem has been, it is argued, that scholars in each of these schools of thought have been over-eager to construct over-arching models and theories, which have not been sensitive or applicable to the diversity and complexity of the African experience.

The book's own approach is one that, according to the author, is driven, not by adherence to any 'grand theory or interpretation' nor by the unsubstantiated assumption that economic history can be fully understood on the basis of the 'markets of neo-classical theorists, the world system of the dependency writers, or the modes of production of the Marxists' (p. 5), but by the fundamental conviction that, ultimately, 'economic history is about people, how they produce and reproduce their daily lives in their households, communities, societies, states, regions and within the continent as a whole' (p. 5). This is not to dismiss the importance of material and social conditions of production and reproduction but merely to emphasise the fact that these forces and relations do not operate in a vacuum. Rather they interact in a complex way with 'nature and society, men and women, rulers and ruled, locals and foreigners, the past and the present' (p. 5).

Though a welcome and very useful contribution to the growing discourse on Africa's pre-colonial past, *A Modern Economic History of Africa* does have one major flaw which arises mainly from its rather ambitious scope; not only encompassing a wide variety of subjects, each of which would be a legitimate subject of a book on its own, but also an entire continent. In undertaking this multi-subject and continent-wide study, the author spreads himself thin and runs the risk of making the same generalisations which he castigates past scholarship for making. It is, for instance, not always clear whether what applies to the case studies that the author uses for his analysis is equally applicable to the whole continent throughout the 19th century.

The interests of detailed analysis and thorough treatment of issues would have been better served had the author focused on one or two topics covering carefully chosen regions of the continent. The continent-wide approach not only produces an unwieldy array of facts which are rather difficult to digest but also results in a voluminous book whose price, though not indicated on the book cover, can only be beyond the reach of many potential readers on the African continent for whom, presumably, the book was written.

The above shortcoming aside, however, *A Modern Economic History of Africa* is a welcome and valuable contribution to scholarship which raises the discourse on the African pre-colonial experience to new heights. It is a well-packaged, competently edited and well-written book which should be of use to professional historians, economic historians, high school teachers and any lay readers who are interested in understanding the forces that shaped Africa's historical development on the eve of European colonialism.

University of Zimbabwe

A. S. MLAMBO

The Political Economy of the Sugar Industry in Zimbabwe, 1920-90 By A. S. Mlambo and E. S. Pangeti. Harare, University of Zimbabwe Publications, 1996, iv, 90 pp., ISBN 0-908307-43-8, Z\$50.

The book describes the various stages of growth of the sugar industry in Zimbabwe, and the different types of control that are responsible for getting the industry where it currently is. The authors present the establishment of the industry by individuals like McDougall, and later by government, and then by international entrepreneurs. The book describes the operations of the industry during various government regimes and analyses the impact of international relations on the performance of the industry. The final chapter looks at the marketing opportunities and constraints in the region and in distant international markets.

While the book illustrates the importance of history for the understanding of economic development, the book could be strengthened by paying more attention to economic, political and institutional frameworks or paradigms. Several questions can be posed to draw attention to potential avenues for analysis.

The authors readily present reasons given in the reports they reviewed, without providing critical analysis of their own. It seems that they sympathise with the sugar producers. They suggest that the Zimbabwe sugar industry is in its infancy (p.1). This is a typical argument for government protection against cheap imports of sugar, but one that does not appeal to domestic consumers or tax-payers. Statements like 'domestic retail sugar prices are too low' need some kind of objective justification.

The authors note the industry's contribution to employment generation. While the number of people employed is in the thousands, there is no indication of incomes earned by these employees. Wages may be small relative to other expenses or profits, as is suggested by the strikes in the early months of 1996.

The book pays insufficient attention to the link between government and the economy. As long as the sugar industry makes a significant contribution to the economy, the government will try to keep the industry alive through various forms of preferential treatment, such as monopoly of the domestic market, procurement of African labour, soft loans, and construction of all-weather roads. In the end the distinction between what is private and what is public becomes blurred.

The authors pay insufficient attention to the analysis of government interventions and control. What were the financial reasons behind government take-over of the estates, and their lack of profitability under government control? How are market forces affected by various forms of government support for the industry?

It is not clear how ecological characteristics affected the siting of sugar estates in the Lowveld. Was it drainage patterns, or was it that the extensive production of sugar required vast amounts of cheap land? When the government was pushing for settlers to be part of the production scheme under contract, the Hewletts did not support the idea: readers could be helped by an analysis of alternatives proposed. More could be said on the different treatment of Black and White settler schemes.

Readers would also benefit from a closer analysis of how the industry survived under the economic sanctions following Rhodesia's Unilateral Declaration of Independence. Internationally, more could be said on the way cartels control prices of such commodities as sugar.

In the presentation of graphs and tables, more attention should be paid to ensure that figures are comparable, and that the text relates clearly and explains the variations that the figures reveal.

Overall, the book provides a useful descriptive account of the history of the sugar industry in Zimbabwe, but is limited in its economic analysis of the issue that it raises.

University of Zimbabwe

J. GOVEREH