

### CHAPTER III

## EVALUATION OF GLYPHOSATE TOLERANCE OF COMMON TURFGRASS WEED POPULATIONS

**ABSTRACT:** Research was conducted to determine if populations of common turfgrass weeds differ in tolerance to glyphosate. A greenhouse experiment was conducted with large crabgrass (*Digitaria sanguinalis* L.), dandelion (*Taraxacum officinale* Weber), annual bluegrass (*Poa annua* L. var. *annua*) and creeping bentgrass (*Agrostis stolonifera* L. cv. 'Penncross'). Seeds of each species from at least 2 populations and seeds collected from populations whose parental material was exposed to different glyphosate application regimes were planted in 35 cm x 60 cm x 15 cm black flats filled with 24:9:35:32 (v:v:v:v) sand, soil, peat moss, vermiculite soil mix, respectively. Survival counts were collected after one and two applications of 1.68 kg a.e. glyphosate ha<sup>-1</sup> (Roundup Pro<sup>®</sup> Pro formulation with 356 g L<sup>-1</sup> of glyphosate acid). Plant survival based on 1) percent of plants that survived a single glyphosate application per number germinated; 2) percent of plants that survived two applications per number of plants germinated; and 3) percent of plants that survived two applications based on number of plants that survived the first application. Plant survival from a single 1.68 kg a.e. glyphosate ha<sup>-1</sup> application ranged from 0 to 72% for all populations of all species, with the dandelion populations exhibiting the greatest range. Some

populations of dandelion plants collected from plants surviving previous glyphosate applications had up to four times higher survival of a single glyphosate application than the parent population. In addition, some large crabgrass and dandelion populations that survived two glyphosate applications exhibited similar results. Survival numbers from these studies were higher than reported by others. Plant response to glyphosate based on plant survival appears to be more conservative than response based on control estimates.

**NOMENCLATURE:** glyphosate; creeping bentgrass, *Agrostis stolonifera* L. cv. 'Penncross'; large crabgrass, *Digitaria sanguinalis* L.; annual bluegrass, *Poa annua* L. var. *annua*; dandelion, *Taraxacum officinale* Weber.

**ADDITIONAL INDEX WORDS:** glyphosate, glyphosate-tolerance, survival, turfgrass weeds.

**ABBREVIATIONS:** DAS, d after seeding; LSD, least significant difference;

## INTRODUCTION

Glyphosate [N-(phosphonomethyl)glycine] blocks the aromatic amino acid biosynthetic pathway in plants and has been used for weed control in cropping and aquatic systems since the 1970's (Jaworski, 1972). The initial uses for glyphosate were non-selective applications for pre-plant, dormant grass, orchard, right-of-way, and ornamental weed control. Recent advances in genetic engineering have developed glyphosate resistant crops for selective weed

control (Marshall, 1998). Previous glyphosate resistant crops have been grown in annual cropping systems.

Glyphosate-resistant genes recently have been introduced to several turfgrass species, such as creeping bentgrass (*Agrostis stolonifera* L.) and Kentucky bluegrass (*Poa pratensis* L.) (Kind, 1998). Little is known regarding the use of glyphosate for selective weed control in a perennial grass system. Weed control strategies differ between annual cropping systems and perennial grasses. The goals of weed control in annual cropping systems is related to the impact on crop yield and harvest quality. In a turfgrass system, higher levels of control are required to ensure high quality turf surfaces without visible disruptions based on aesthetics. The use rates and yearly application amounts could be greater in turfgrass systems due to the necessity for more complete control associated with aesthetics and the inability to use cultivation methods for weed control (Beard, 1973). The rapid adoption, current use of glyphosate resistant crops and increasing numbers of glyphosate resistant weed populations further substantiates the need to understand the weed population dynamics in herbicide resistant crops (Heap, 1997).

In addition, increased herbicide tolerance and/or resistance with time by specific weed populations has been documented (Table 3.1). Previous research has compared the relative survival rates of various populations of weed species or the relative survival rates of various weed species whose parental material survived glyphosate applications.

The objectives of the research were 1) to compare glyphosate survival rates of several populations of common turfgrass weeds and 2) to determine if seeds collected from plants surviving glyphosate applications produced progeny populations with different glyphosate survival rates than the parent or preceding generation.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

Greenhouse research was conducted at the University of Nebraska (Lincoln, NE). Experiments were initiated 7 May, 17 May, 8 July, 11 July and 16 July 2002. Twenty-five seeds of each population of annual bluegrass (*Poa annua* L. var. *annua*), large crabgrass (*Digitaria sanguinalis* L.), dandelion (*Taraxacum officinale* Weber) and creeping bentgrass (*Agrostis stolonifera* L. cv. 'Penncross') seeds per were placed 1 cm below soil surface in straight 2.5 cm rows in 35 cm x 60 cm x 15 cm black flats filled with 24:9:35:32 (v:v:v:v) sand, soil, peat moss, vermiculite soil mix, respectively. Seed sources included dandelion (from England, Illinois and California), annual bluegrass (from England and Oregon), and large crabgrass (from England, Iowa and California). The history of the seed sources' exposure to glyphosate is unknown. In addition, seed was collected from a previous experiment using glyphosate. Creeping bentgrass populations were commercially available cultivars 'A-4', 'Providence' and 'Penncross'. For simplicity, seed sources will be identified as indicated by the following seed source numbers.

*Annual bluegrass*

- 1) England collected by Herbiseed (New Farm, Mire Lane, West End, Twyford, RG10 0NJ, England)
- 2) Oregon collected by V and J Seed Farms (P.O. Box 82, Woodstock, IL 60098)
- 3) Oregon collected by Valley Seed Service (P. O. Box 9335, Fresno, California 93791)

*Dandelion*

- 1) England collected by Herbiseed
- 2) Illinois collected by V and J Seed Farms
- 3) California collected by Valley Seed Service

*Large crabgrass*

- 1) England collected by Herbiseed
- 2) Iowa collected by V and J Seed Farms
- 3) California collected by Valley Seed Service

In addition to the above weed populations, seed was collected from a previous experiment in which plants were treated with various glyphosate applications. In this previous experiment, seed was collected from surviving plants originating from population 1 after received the following treatments on 2 week intervals with the first application occurring 30 d after seeding (DAS). Seed sources will be identified as indicated by the following seed source letters. Numbers indicate a single application in kg a.e. glyphosate ha<sup>-1</sup>.

- A)  $0.00 + 0.00 + 0.00 + 0.00 + 0.00 + 0.00 + 0.00$
- B)  $0.00 + 0.00 + 0.00 + 0.00 + 0.84 + 0.84 + 2.24$
- C)  $0.01 + 0.01 + 0.01 + 0.01 + 0.84 + 0.84 + 2.24$
- D)  $0.05 + 0.05 + 0.05 + 0.05 + 0.84 + 0.84 + 2.24$
- E)  $0.10 + 0.10 + 0.10 + 0.10 + 0.84 + 0.84 + 2.24$
- F)  $0.50 + 0.50 + 0.50 + 0.50 + 0.84 + 0.84 + 2.24$
- G)  $5.00 + 5.00 + 5.00 + 5.00 + 0.84 + 0.84 + 2.24$

The arrangement of plants in previous experiments allowed for open pollination prior to collection of seed.

Number of germinated plants were determined 43 DAS. Glyphosate (Roundup<sup>®</sup> Pro formulation with 356 g L<sup>-1</sup> of glyphosate acid) was applied 45 DAS at 2.24 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> to all flats. The number of surviving plants with green, growing tissue that were increasing in biomass were counted 70 DAS. The two flats seeded on 7 and 17 May 2002 also received an additional glyphosate application 71 DAS. An additional survival count was made 90 DAS for those two flats. Glyphosate treatments were applied with a conveyor, pressurized (276 kPa) sprayer in 374 L ha<sup>-1</sup> of water. Plants were watered daily until soil saturation except 24 hr following glyphosate application. Every 7 d, Peters 20-10-20 fertilizer (200 N ppm; J.R. Peters, Inc., 6656 Grant Way, Allentown, PA 18106) was applied through the irrigation water. Newly emerging plants were removed by hand after glyphosate application and were not used for analysis.

Survival following the first glyphosate application for each population was determined by dividing the number of surviving plants by the total number of treated plants. Survival from the second glyphosate application was determined by dividing the number of surviving plants by both the total number of plants that germinated and the total number of plants that survived the first glyphosate application. Although data follow a binomial distribution, pooling means of survival within a pot allows the experiment to be analyzed with a Gaussian distribution due to the Central Limit Theorem (March and Seppalainen, 1997). Therefore, survival data were subjected to ANOVA analysis by population for each species using SAS PROC GLM procedures. Fisher's protected least significant differences (LSD) were computed. Significance levels of either 0.10 or 0.15 were used because of the relatively small number of experimental replicates used.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The results of the experiment indicate trends for natural variability of survival of glyphosate applications between populations of a given weed species (Tables 3.2-3.4). However, none of the species showed different survival at the 0.05 significance level. Typically, binomial and ratio data require high number of experimental units to gain the same statistical power as continuous Gaussian data (Evans et. al., 2000). Additional experimental replicates were not conducted due to seed availability and time restrictions. Increasing replication may increase



the statistical power of the study. Significant trends at the 0.10 and 0.15 significance levels will be used for the purposes of discussion.

Annual bluegrass, creeping bentgrass and large crabgrass populations evaluated did not differ in survival of a single glyphosate application (Table 3.2). Most of the populations had survival less than 23%. The exceptions were annual bluegrass collected from a population with no glyphosate history (40%), large crabgrass population 2 from California (25%) and large crabgrass population 1 from England subjected to treatment C (25%). Annual bluegrass survival ranged from 11 to 40%. Creeping bentgrass survival ranged from 15 to 23%. Large crabgrass survival ranged from 0 to 25%.

Dandelion populations did differ in survival of a single glyphosate application (Table 3.2;  $\alpha = 0.10$ ). Dandelion survival ranged from 0 to 72%. The two populations, population 2 from Illinois (0%) and population 1 from England (16%), had the lowest survival. Seed collected from population 1 exposed to treatments A,B and D-F did have higher survival, but only seeds from plants receiving treatment B and E were significantly higher than the parent population. These results may indicate a dandelion population's overall glyphosate tolerance is higher than other species investigated and may be different after survival of a previous glyphosate application.

Annual bluegrass, creeping bentgrass, large crabgrass and dandelion populations did not differ in survival based on the original number of treated plants surviving two glyphosate applications (Table 3.2). Since survival was



determined from only two experimental replicates, trends are not evident. In addition, the two experimental replicates used for the second glyphosate application had the highest germination rates of all of the runs (data not shown). Therefore, some of the survival data are higher than for a single glyphosate application. Survival of two glyphosate applications would be expected to be lower than a single glyphosate application (Culpepper et al., 2000).

Survival of annual bluegrass, creeping bentgrass and large crabgrass receiving two glyphosate applications was less than 13% (Table 3.3). Exceptions included annual bluegrass population 1 from Oregon subjected to treatment A (50%) and treatments D (13%) and G (25%). In addition, the 'A-4' creeping bentgrass (27%) and large crabgrass population 1 from England subjected to treatment A (13%) and treatment C (63%) had survival above 13%. Dandelion survival ranged from 0 to 75%, with a majority of the treatments above 40%. A trend to increased survival of two glyphosate applications for plant populations collected from plants surviving glyphosate application is present, but requires further experimentation to confirm the trend. The high level of tolerance to two glyphosate applications further indicates a dandelion population's overall glyphosate tolerance is higher than other species investigated and may be increased after survival of a previous glyphosate application.

Survival of two glyphosate applications by all populations of annual bluegrass and creeping bentgrass are not different when survival is based on the number of plants surviving the first glyphosate application (Table 3.4). Survival

ranged from 0 to 50% for annual bluegrass and 12 to 42% for creeping bentgrass populations. Although none of the parent annual bluegrass population 1 from England survived two glyphosate applications, populations produced from seed collected from plants exposed to glyphosate had 25 to 50% survival. In addition, population 1 from England subjected to treatment A showed 50% survival. Although the trend is not significant, the increased survival of plants from seed collected from the population 1 from England that did not receive glyphosate could be attributed to cross pollination and exchange of genetic material from other plants surviving glyphosate. Further experiments would be required to interpret the trend.

Large crabgrass and dandelion populations are different ( $\alpha = 0.15$ ) when survival is based on the number of plants surviving the first glyphosate application (Table 3.4). Large crabgrass survival ranged from 0 to 100%. The highest survival populations resulted from population 1 from England receiving treatment C (100%), which is not significantly different than populations 1 from England receiving treatment A (63%). Dandelion survival ranged from 0 to 100%. The highest survival resulted from population 1 from England receiving treatments D (100%), E (86%) and F (100%). Each of these populations were not significantly different than their parent population 1 (67%) or population receiving 1 receiving treatment B (50%). Population 2 did not survive.

Percent control is typically measured by visual cover over a plot area. In this experiment, plant survival was measured on a plant count basis. Johnson et.

al. (1998) measured the number of large crabgrass plants  $m^{-2}$ , but found glyphosate applied at a full label rate contained 35 plants  $m^{-2}$ , while the control plots only contained 23 plants  $m^{-2}$ . Application timing could have influenced survival rates from glyphosate, but should not directly increase the number of plants per area. Most previous experiments measuring control of the species investigated using glyphosate showed high levels of control using lower rates of glyphosate. Buhler et. al. (1990) applied 1.1 kg a.e. glyphosate  $ha^{-1}$  to dandelion and showed 94, 96 and 63% control 20, 80, and 350 DAT, respectively. The loss of control 350 DAT may be attributed to new plants or new growth from previously injured plants. Culpepper et. al. (2001) found at least 99% control of large crabgrass 2 and 5 weeks after treatment when glyphosate was applied at rates of 0.56, 0.84 and 1.12 kg a.i.  $ha^{-1}$ . Culpepper and York (1998) found large crabgrass was not adequately controlled with one application, but control was acceptable when a second glyphosate application was made 4 weeks after the initial application. Gimenez et. al. (1998) obtained 100% control of large crabgrass 1 and 3 weeks after treatment when 0.42, 0.56 and 0.84 kg a.e. glyphosate  $ha^{-1}$  was applied. Moseley and Hagood (1991) obtained 91 and 96% control of large crabgrass with applications of 0.11 and 0.55 kg a.i. glyphosate  $ha^{-1}$ , respectively, were made in addition to 0.04 kg chlorimuron  $ha^{-1}$  and 0.46 kg linuron  $ha^{-1}$ .

In these studies, survival was based on a plant count basis. Survival numbers were larger than would be obtained from experiments based on percent

control. For example, much lower glyphosate application rates provided 91 and 96% control of large crabgrass (Moseley and Hagood, 1991). However, this experiment indicated 10-25% of the plants may still survive at much higher rates. Although plants are injured, regrowth and future reproduction are possible, especially in perennial systems. The weakness of the method is the requirement for many experimental units to obtain the same level of precision as percent control estimations. In this experiment, alpha levels of 0.10 and 0.15 allowed for statistical separation of treatments. Some populations of dandelion plants collected from plants surviving previous glyphosate applications had higher survival of a single glyphosate application than the parent population. In addition, some large crabgrass and dandelion populations that survived two glyphosate applications had higher survival from two glyphosate applications than the parent population.

**Table 3.1.** Documented weed populations with herbicide tolerance and/or resistance.

| Scientific Name                             | Common Name          | Researcher                  |
|---|----------------------|-----------------------------|
| <i>Avena fatua</i> L.                       | wild oat             | Kern et al., 1996           |
| <i>Chenopodium album</i> L.                 | common lambsquarters | Darmency and Gasquez, 1990  |
| <i>Convolvulus arvensis</i> L.              | field bindweed       | Westwood and Weller, 1997   |
| <i>Conyza canadensis</i> L. Cronq.          | horseweed            | Mueller et al., 2003        |
| <i>Conyza canadensis</i> L. Cronq.          | horseweed            | VanGessel, 2001             |
| <i>Echinochloa oryzoides</i> (Ard.) Fritsch | early watergrass     | Fischer et al., 2000        |
| <i>Echinochloa phyllopogon</i> (Stapf) Koss | late watergrass      | Fischer et al., 2000        |
| <i>Eleusine indica</i> (L.) Gaertn.         | goosegrass           | Lee and Ngim, 2000          |
| <i>Eleusine indica</i> (L.) Gaertn.         | goosegrass           | Vaughn et al., 1990         |
| <i>Kochia scoparia</i> (L.) Schrad.         | Kochia               | Christoffoleti et al., 1997 |
| <i>Kochia scoparia</i> (L.) Schrad.         | Kochia               | Foes et al., 1999           |
| <i>Lolium rigidum</i> Gaudin.               | rigid ryegrass       | Burnet et al., 1994         |
| <i>Lolium rigidum</i> Gaudin.               | rigid ryegrass       | Gill et al., 1996           |
| <i>Lolium rigidum</i> Gaudin.               | rigid ryegrass       | Llewellyn and Powles, 2001  |
| <i>Lolium rigidum</i> Gaudin.               | rigid ryegrass       | Powles et al., 1998         |
| <i>Lolium rigidum</i> Gaudin.               | rigid ryegrass       | Pratley et al., 1999        |
| <i>Lotus corniculatus</i> L.                | birdsfoot trefoil    | Boerboom et al., 1990       |
| <i>Poa annua</i> L.                         | annual bluegrass     | Kelly et al., 1999          |
| <i>Raphanus raphanistrum</i> L.             | wild radish          | Walsh et al., 2001          |
| <i>Sisymbrium orientale</i> Torn.           | Indian hedgemustard  | Boutsalis and Powles, 1995  |
| <i>Sonchus oleraceus</i> L.                 | common sowthistle    | Boutsalis and Powles, 1995  |
| various                                     | various              | Heap, 1997                  |

**Table 3.2.** Percent survival of annual bluegrass, creeping bentgrass, dandelion, and large crabgrass surviving 1.68 kg a.e. glyphosate ha<sup>-1</sup> from several seed sources and seed collected from a previous experiment.

| Seed Source       | <i>Poa annua</i>  | <i>Agrostis stolonifera</i> | <i>Digitaria sanguinalis</i> | <i>Taraxacum officinale</i> |
|-------------------|---|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
|                   | ----- % (number-surviving glyphosate per number-germinated per hundred) ----- |                             |                              |                             |
| Population 1 †    | 18 a †  | -                           | 14 a                         | 16 bc                       |
| Population 2      | 20 a  | -                           | 10 a                         | 0 c                         |
| Population 3      | 16 a  | -                           | 25 a                         | -                           |
| 1 + treatment A § | 40 a  | -                           | 16 a                         | 53 ab                       |
| 1 + treatment B   | -   | -                           | -                            | 72 a                        |
| 1 + treatment C   | 11 a  | -                           | 25 a                         | -                           |
| 1 + treatment D   | 15 a  | -                           | 0 a                          | 47 ab                       |
| 1 + treatment E   | -   | -                           | 0 a                          | 68 a                        |
| 1 + treatment F   | -   | -                           | -                            | 50 ab                       |
| 1 + treatment G   | 18 a  | -                           | -                            | -                           |
| A-4 #             | -   | 22 a                        | -                            | -                           |
| Providence        | -   | 23 a                        | -                            | -                           |
| Penncross         | -   | 16 a                        | -                            | -                           |

† Population 1 (All populations from England), Population 2 (*P. annua* from Oregon, *D. sanguinalis* from Iowa, *T. officinale* from Illinois), Population 3 (*P. annua* from Oregon, *D. sanguinalis* and *T. officinale* from California).

‡ Treatments in a column followed by the same letter are not significantly different at 0.10 probability level.

§ Treatments A-G were collected from surviving plants originating from population 1 and received the following treatments on 2 week intervals (kg glyphosate ha<sup>-1</sup>): A) 0 + 0 + 0 + 0 + 0; B) 0 + 0 + 0 + 0 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; C) 0.01 + 0.01 + 0.01 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; D) 0.05 + 0.05 + 0.05 + 0.05 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; E) 0.10 + 0.10 + 0.10 + 0.10 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; F) 0.50 + 0.50 + 0.50 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; G) 5 + 5 + 5 + 5 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24

# A-4, Providence and Penncross are commercially available creeping bentgrass cultivars

**Table 3.3.** Percent survival of annual bluegrass, creeping bentgrass, dandelion, and large crabgrass surviving 2x1.68 (3.36 total) kg a.e. glyphosate ha<sup>-1</sup> from several seed sources and seed collected from a previous experiment.

| Seed Source                  | <i>Poa annua</i> | <i>Agrostis stolonifera</i> | <i>Digitaria sanguinalis</i> | <i>Taraxacum officinale</i> |
|------------------------------|------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Herbiseed (H) †              | 0 a †            | -                           | 9 a                          | 17 a                        |
| V and J Seed Source          | 2 a              | -                           | 10 a                         | 0 a                         |
| Valley Seed                  | 2 a              | -                           | 8 a                          | -                           |
| H + no glyphosate            | 50 a             | -                           | 13 a                         | 63 a                        |
| H + treatment A <sup>s</sup> | -                | -                           | -                            | 50 a                        |
| H + treatment B              | 10 a             | -                           | 63 a                         | -                           |
| H + treatment C              | 13 a             | -                           | 0 a                          | 67 a                        |
| H + treatment D              | -                | -                           | 0 a                          | 42 a                        |
| H + treatment E              | -                | -                           | -                            | 75 a                        |
| H + treatment F              | 25 a             | -                           | -                            | -                           |
| A-4 <sup>#</sup>             | -                | 27 a                        | -                            | -                           |
| Providence                   | -                | 12 a                        | -                            | -                           |
| Penncross                    | -                | 10 a                        | -                            | -                           |

† Population 1 (All populations from England), Population 2 (*P. annua* from Oregon, *D. sanguinalis* from Iowa, *T. officinale* from Illinois), Population 3 (*P. annua* from Oregon, *D. sanguinalis* and *T. officinale* from California).

‡ Treatments in a column followed by the same letter are not significantly different at 0.15 probability level.

§§ Treatments A-G were collected from surviving plants originating from population 1 and received the following treatments on 2 week intervals (kg glyphosate ha<sup>-1</sup>): A) 0 + 0 + 0 + 0 + 0 + 0; B) 0 + 0 + 0 + 0 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; C) 0.01 + 0.01 + 0.01 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; D) 0.05 + 0.05 + 0.05 + 0.05 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; E) 0.10 + 0.10 + 0.10 + 0.10 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; F) 0.50 + 0.50 + 0.50 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; G) 5 + 5 + 5 + 5 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24

# A-4, Providence and Penncross are commercially available creeping bentgrass cultivars



**Table 3.4.** Percent survival of annual bluegrass, creeping bentgrass, dandelion, and large crabgrass surviving 2x1.68 (3.36 total) kg a.e. glyphosate ha<sup>-1</sup> from several seed sources and seed collected from a previous experiment.

| Seed Source         | <i>Poa annua</i> | <i>Agrostis stolonifera</i> | <i>Digitaria sanguinalis</i> | <i>Taraxacum officinale</i> |
|---------------------|------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Herbiseed (H) †     | 0 a ‡            | -                           | 33 bc                        | 67 ab                       |
| V and J Seed Source | 2 a              | -                           | 25 bc                        | 0 c                         |
| Valley Seed         | 8 a              | -                           | 17 bc                        | -                           |
| H + no glyphosate   | 50 a             | -                           | 63 ab                        | 25 bc                       |
| H + treatment A §   | -                | -                           | -                            | 50 abc                      |
| H + treatment B     | 25 a             | -                           | 100 a                        | -                           |
| H + treatment C     | 50 a             | -                           | 0 c                          | 100 a                       |
| H + treatment D     | -                | -                           | 0 c                          | 86 a                        |
| H + treatment E     | -                | -                           | -                            | 100 a                       |
| H + treatment F     | 40 a             | -                           | -                            | -                           |
| A-4 #               | -                | 42 a                        | -                            | -                           |
| Providence          | -                | 15 a                        | -                            | -                           |
| Pennncross          | -                | 12 a                        | -                            | -                           |

† Population 1 (All populations from England), Population 2 (*P. annua* from Oregon, *D. sanguinalis* from Iowa, *T. officinale* from Illinois), Population 3 (*P. annua* from Oregon, *D. sanguinalis* and *T. officinale* from California).

‡ Treatments in a column followed by the same letter are not significantly different at 0.15 probability level.

§ Treatments A-G were collected from surviving plants originating from population 1 and received the following treatments on 2 week intervals (kg glyphosate ha<sup>-1</sup>): A) 0 + 0 + 0 + 0 + 0; B) 0 + 0 + 0 + 0 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; C) 0.01 + 0.01 + 0.01 + 0.01 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; D) 0.05 + 0.05 + 0.05 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; E) 0.10 + 0.10 + 0.10 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; F) 0.50 + 0.50 + 0.50 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24; G) 5 + 5 + 5 + 5 + 1.12 + 1.12 + 2.24

# A-4, Providence and Pennncross are commercially available creeping bentgrass cultivars

**LITERATURE CITED**

- Beard, J.B. 1973. *Turfgrass: Science and Culture*. Prentice-Hall, Inc. Englewood Cliffs, NJ.
- Boerboom, C.M., D.L. Wyse, and D.A. Somers. 1990. Mechanism of glyphosate tolerance in birdsfoot trefoil (*Lotus corniculatus*). *Weed Sci.* 38: 463-467.
- Boutsalis, P., and S.B. Powles. 1995. Resistance of dicot weeds to acetolactate synthase (ALS)-inhibiting herbicides in Australia. *Weed Res.* 35: 149-155.
- Buhler, D.D, and R.T. Proost. 1990. Sequential herbicide treatments for corn (*Zea mays*) planted into mixed-species perennial sod. *Weed Technol.* 4: 781-786.
- Burnet, M.W.M., Q. Hart, J.A.M. Holtum, and S.B. Powles. 1994. Resistance to nine herbicide classes in a population of rigid ryegrass (*Lolium rigidum*). *Weed Sci.* 42: 369-377.
- Christoffoleti, P.J., P. Westra, and F. Moore, III. 1997. Growth analysis of sulfonylurea-resistant and susceptible Kochia (*Kochia scoparia*). *Weed Sci.* 45: 691-695.
- Culpepper, A.S., A.E. Gimenez, A.C. York, R.B. Batts, and J.W. Wilcut. 2001. Morningglory (*Ipomoea* spp.) and large crabgrass (*Digitaria sanguinalis*) control with glyphosate and 2,4-DB mixtures in glyphosate-resistant soybean (*Glycine max*). *Weed Technol.* 15: 56-61.

- Culpepper, A.S., and A.C. York. 1998. Weed management in glyphosate-tolerant cotton. *J Cotton Sci.* 2: 174-185.
- Culpepper, A.S., A.C. York, R.B. Batts, and K.M. Jennings. 2000. Weed management in glufosinate- and glyphosate-resistant soybean (*Glycine max*). *Weed Technol.* 14: 77-88.
- Darmency, H., and J. Gasquez. 1990. Appearance and spread of triazine resistance in common lambsquarters (*Chenopodium album*). *Weed Technol.* 4: 173-177.
- Evans, M., N. Hastings, B. Peacock. 2000. Statistical Distributions. 3<sup>rd</sup> edition. Wiley: New York.
- Fischer, A.J., C.M. Ateh, D.E. Bayer, and J.E. Hill. 2000. Herbicide-resistant *Echinochloa oryzoides* and *E. phyllopogon* in California *Oryza sativa* fields. *Weed Sci.* 48: 225-230.
- Foes, M.J., L. Liu, G. Vigue, E.W. Stoller, L.M. Wax, and P.J. Tranel. 1999. A *Kochia (Kochia scoparia)* biotype resistant to triazine and ALS-inhibiting herbicides. *Weed Sci.* 47: 20-27.
- Gill, G.S., R.D. Cousens, and M.R. Allan. 1996. Germination, growth, and development of herbicide resistant and susceptible populations of rigid ryegrass (*Lolium rigidum*). *Weed Sci.* 44: 252-256.

- Gimenez, A.E., A.C. York, J.W. Wilcut, and R.B. Batts. 1998. Annual grass control by glyphosate plus bentazon, chlorimuron, fomesafen, or imazethapyr mixtures. *Weed Technol.* 12: 134-136.
- Heap, I.M. 1997. The occurrence of herbicide resistant weeds worldwide. *Pestic. Sci.* 51: 235-243.
- Jaworski, E. G. 1972. Mode of action of *N*-phosphonomethylglycine: Inhibition of aromatic amino acid biosynthesis. *J. Agr. Food Chem.*, 20: 1195-1198.
- Johnson, W.G., J.S. Dilbeck, M.S. Defelice, and J.A. Kendig. 1998. Weed control with reduced rates of chlorimuron plus metribuzin and imazethapyr in no-till narrow-row soybean (*Glycine max*). *Weed Technol.* 12: 32-36.
- Kelly, S. T., G. E. Coats, and D.S. Luthe. 1999. Mode of resistance of triazine-resistant annual bluegrass (*Poa annua*). *Weed Technol.* 13: 747-752.
- Kern, A.J., C.T. Colliver, B.D. Maxwell, P.K. Fay, and W.E. Dyer. 1996. Characterization of wild oat (*Avena fatua* L.) populations and an inbred line with multiple herbicide resistance. *Weed Sci.* 44: 847-852.
- Kind, M. 1998. Can grasses resist Roundup, Finale? *Golf Course Manage.* Jan: 48.

- Lee, L.J., and J. Ngim. 2000. A first report of glyphosate-resistant goosegrass (*Eleusine indica* (L) Gaertn) in Malaysia. *Pest Management Sci.* 56: 336-339.
- Llewellyn, R.S., and S.B. Powles. 2001. High levels of herbicide resistance in rigid ryegrass (*Lolium rigidum*) in the wheat belt of western Australia. *Weed Technol.* 15: 242-248.
- March, P., and T. Seppalainen. 1997. Large deviations from the almost everywhere central limit theorem, *J. Theor. Probab.* 10: 935-965.
- Marshall, G. 1998. Herbicide-tolerant crops—Real farmer opportunity or potential environmental problem? *Pestic. Sci.* 52: 394-402.
- Moseley, C.M., and E.S. Hagood, Jr. 1991. Decreasing rates of nonselective herbicides in double-crop no-till soybeans (*Glycine max*). *Weed Technol.* 5: 198-201.
- Mueller, T.C., J.H. Massey, R.M. Hayes, C.L. Main, and C.N. Stewart, Jr. 2003. Shikimate accumulates in both glyphosate-sensitive and glyphosate-resistant horseweed (*Conyza canadensis* L. Cronq.). *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 51: 680-684.
- Powles, S.B., D.F. Lorraine-Colwill, J.J. Dellow, and C. Preston. 1998. Evolved resistance to glyphosate in rigid ryegrass (*Lolium rigidum*) in Australia. *Weed Sci.* 46: 604-607.

- Pratley, J., N. Urwin, R. Stanton, P. Baines, J. Broster, K. Cullis, D. Schafer, J. Bohn, and R. Krueger. 1999. Resistance to glyphosate in *Lolium rigidum*: I. Bioevaluation. *Weed Sci.* 47: 405-411.
- VanGessel, M.J. 2001. Glyphosate-resistant horseweed from Delaware. *Weed Sci.* 49: 703-705.
- Vaughn, K.C., M.A. Vaughan, and B.J. Gossett. 1990. A biotype of goosegrass (*Eleusine indica*) with an intermediate level of dinitroaniline herbicide resistance. *Weed Technol.* 4: 157-162.
- Walsh, M.J., R.D. Duane, and S.B. Powles. 2001. High frequency of chlorsulfuron-resistant wild radish (*Raphanus raphanistrum*) populations across the western Australian wheatbelt. *Weed Technol.* 15: 199-203.
- Westwood, J.H., and S.C. Weller. 1997. Cellular mechanisms influence differential glyphosate sensitivity in field bindweed (*Convolvulus arvensis*) biotypes. *Weed Sci.* 45: 2-11.