196

STATE OF MICHIGAN

DEPARTMENT OF LABOR

EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF:

CITY OF MANISTEE

And

MANISTEE POLICE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION

DECISION AND AWARD OF ARBITRATION PANEL

8/10

LABOR AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS LIERARY Michigan State University JUL 27 1976

Reinke, Willis

STATE OF MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF LABOR EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

City of Manistee

And

Manistee Police Officers Association

DECISION AND AWARD OF ARBITRATION PANEL

On August 3, 1970, the undersigned, Willis A. Reinke, was appointed by the Chairman of the Employment Relations Commission, Robert G. Howlett, as impartial chairman of a Panel of Arbitrators pursuant to Act 312 Public Acts of 1969. John E. Hart had been named as Arbitrator by the City of Manistee and William H. Lindeman by the Manistee Police Officers Association.

A pre-hearing conference was held on August 14, 1970. Hearing was held and testimony taken at the Manistee City Hall on August 14, 1970 from 10:00 A. M. until 3:00 P. M. Conferences were held between the Arbitrators from the conclusion of the hearing until 6:00 P. M. on the 14th and again on August 21, 1970 at the City Hall in Manistee.

A verbatim record of the hearing was made by Marshall Rosenow, Reporter for the Court of the 19th Circuit, including Manistee County. Transcripts were ordered by the City and the Police Officers Association.

The Arbitrators appointed by the City and the Police Officers
Association presented their own cases. The Association offered
two witnesses, Walter J. Witkowski, employed as a Police Patrolman II
by the City of Manistee, and, Robert Brunette, owner-operator of

the Hobby-Toy Store, formerly employed as a Police Patrolman by the City of Manistee, and prior thereto by the City of Detroit. The substance of their testimony related to the duties and responsibilities of Police Patrolmen in Manistee, and Brunette's testimony further related to the additional responsibilities devolving upon Police Patrolmen in a small city as contrasted to those in the City of Detroit. The Manistee Patrolman in answering felony and misdemeanor calls must prepare their own follow up work including finger printing, foot prints, tire marks, photography, etc. as opposed to the situation in Detroit where the follow up work is performed by trained specialists.

Full opportunity was afforded to the Representatives for examination and cross examination. Opening and closing statements were made by Messrs. Hart and Lindeman. A number of Exhibits were submitted including the Association's original request to the City for arbitration; the joint request of the parties to the Employment Relations Commission for appointment of a Chairman of the Arbitration Panel; a copy of the latest contract between the parties; a copy of the City's proposed budget for the fiscal year ending June 30, 1970, and a number of Police Department Wage and Benefit Schedules for comparison purposes including Petoskey, Cadillac, Ferris State College and Grand Haven.

Both parties entered in good faith into the discussions leading to this award.

ISSUES AND PROPOSALS

The Police Officers Association on the record reverted to its original contract proposal, basically as follows:

- 1. 20% wage increase effective July 1, 1970.
- 2. Shift Premium Afternoon 10¢ Evening 15¢
- 3. Overtime -- 40 Hour Week 8 Hour Day
 Overtime to be at time and one-half

4. Vacations:

1 Year Service 2 Weeks
10 Years Service 3 Weeks
15 Years Service 4 Weeks
20 Years Service 5 Weeks

(Current Schedule is)

3 Years Service 2 Weeks 10 Years Service 3 Weeks 20 Years Service 4 Weeks

5. Holidays:

Add ½ Day Good Friday Add ½ Day Christmas Eve

Equal time off for all holidays granted other City Employees

Currently

New Years
Decoration Day
Independence Day
Labor Day
Thanksgiving Day
Employee's Birthday
Christmas Day
Half-Day Christmas Eve
Half-Day Good Friday

6. Employer pay 100% cost of Uniform, including one pair of shoes annually and \$150.00 per year for Uniform maintenance, \$75.00 on July 1st, and \$75.00 on September 1st.
Furnish 5 Cell Flashlight.

7. Call In Time:

- (a) If called in after day's shift and before next day's shift, time and one-half or 4 Hours straight time, whichever is greater
- (b) Court Time. 4 Hours cash or compensatory time at officer's option
- (c) Officers may accumulate up to 32 hours overtime. Excess to be paid at time and one-half. Any not used in 90 days to be paid at time and one-half.

(Police now receive straight time or compensatory time off)

8. Permission to Take Vacation on any shift:

8 P.M. to 4 A.M.
7 A.M. to 3 P.M.
4 P.M. to 12 P.M.
3 P.M. to 11 P.M.
12 Midnight to 8 A.M.
11 P.M. to 7 A.M.
9 P.M. to 5 A.M.
1 A.M. to 9 A. M.

9. Longevity Bonus:

Current

3 Years 5 Years 10 Years 15 Years 20 Years 25 Years	\$50.00 100.00 150.00 200.00 250.00 300.00	5 Years \$50.00 10 Years 100.00 15 Years 150.00 20 Years 200.00 25 Years 250.00
--	---	---

- Overtime to be distributed as evenly as possible. Refusal list to be currently posted including non-acceptance.
- 11. Include in Article VII, Section 3 (Funeral Leave)
 Grandfather and Grandmother
- 12. Cost of Living Allowance:

lc for each .4 rise in B.L.S. Index Adjusted Quarterly.

The City proposed <u>alternatively:</u> 1 Year Contract

- 8% Wage Increase Life Insurance increase from \$2000.00 to \$5000.00 City to assume cost of Blue-cross Blue-Shield Service
- 2. 2 Year Agreement with reopening on Public Safety Officer Pay 8% Wage Increase \$400.00 Public Safety Officer Pay Hospitalization cost increases paid by City \$2000.00 to \$5000.00 Life Insurance Increase Premium Pay effective 1/1/71: 5c Afternoon Shift 10c Evening Shift

The Police Officers Association indicated basic objections
to a two year contract and to separation of the 8% and the \$400.00
proposed
additive compensation for SMANMANAN Public Safety Officer duties.
The Public Safety Officers concept as indicated in a directive
for the Chief of Police provides that designated patrolman will
answer fire calls and assist in fighting fires. The City, in
November 1969 had considered integrating the Police and Fire
Departments, but receded from that position. In order to beef
up the police force and afford basis for additional compensation,
three firemen were transferred to the police department as patrolmen

and not replaced. To take up the slack created it was proposed to assign Public Safety Officer duties as indicated to policemen. Apparently at one period during negotiations the concept was accepted by the Police Officers Association on the basis of a one year contract but negotiations broke down when the City insisted limited to negotiations on on a two year agreement with a reopener resumment with a reo

CONSIDERATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

The statute pursuant to which this proceeding came into being and this panel functions poses certain specific criteria which the panel must consider in arriving at a conclusion.

- "(a) The lawful authority of the employer
- (b) Stipulations of the parties
- (c) The interests and welfare of the public and the financial ability of the unit of government to meet those costs.
- (d) Comparison of the wages, hours and conditions of employment of the employees involved in the arbitration proceeding with the wages, hours and conditions of employment of other employees performing similar services and with other employees generally:
 - (a) In public employment in comparable communities.(b) In private employment in comparable communities.
- (e) The average consumer prices for goods and services commonly known as the cost of living.
- (f) The overall compensation presently received by the employees, including direct wage compensation, vacations, holidays and other excused time, insurance and pensions, medical and hospitalization benefits, the continuity and stability of employment, and all other benefits received.
- (g) Changes in any of the foregoing circumstances during the pendency of the arbitration proceedings.
- (h) Such other factors, not confined to the foregoing, which are normally or traditionally taken into consideration in the determination of wages, hours and conditions of employment through voluntary collective bargaining mediation, fact-finding, arbitration or otherwise between the parties, in the public service or in private employment.

The Union offered in evidence the following schedules:

. 1. Ferris State College Campus Police Department

Salary Ranges \$6,120.00 \$8,230.00 (Patrolmen)
Overtime Time and One-Half
Holidays Two and One-Half Times when worked
Life Insurance \$10,000.00
Hospitalization Pay Employees Portion
Vacation 12 Days
Holidays 6 Days
Shift Differential None

2. City of Cadillac

Salary Ranges \$6,862.00 \$7,625.00 (Patrolmen)
Overtime Time and one-half
Holidays 10
Hospitalization 100% paid by City
Vacation 1 year 1 week; 2 years 2 weeks,
8 years 3 weeks; 15 years 4 weeks
Life Insurance \$4,500.00
Shift Differential 10c Afternoons 15c Evenings

3. City of Petoskey

Salary Ranges \$7,350.00 \$8,100.00 (Patrolmen)
Overtime Two and one-half or compensatory time off
Holidays Not Stated
Vacation five and one-half to sixteen and one-half days
Hospitalization 100% paid by City
Life Insurance \$1,000.00
Shift Differential None

4. City of Grand Haven

Salary Ranges \$7,687.00 \$8,924.00 (Patrolmen)
Overtime Straight time or compensatory time
Vacation One week to three weeks after 12 years
Holidays None 3 Extra compensatory days off
Hospitalization City pays for employee only
Life Insurance \$4,000.00
Shift Differential Not stated

The City Representative presented its proposed budget and testified that the loss in population indicated by preliminary census figures had imposed further limitations on its ability to pay. The City is currently taxed at the full millage limit.

The following Schedules prevail under the current Manistee appendix:

Salaries

Patrolmen I \$6,379.80
Patrolmen II \$6,693.75

Overtime Straight Time or Compensatory Time
Holidays 7 full days plus 2 half days
Vacation 1 year 1 week; 3 years 2 weeks
10 years 3 weeks; 20 years 4 weeks
Hospitalization Fully paid
Life Insurance \$2,000.00
Shift Differential None

In discussion leading to the award joint agreement was reached on the following issues, with exception of effective date of time and one-half for overtime to which delegate Lindeman dissents:

- 1. The City of Manistee will reimburse policemen for cleaning of uniforms or replacement thereof where the cleaning or replacement is necessitated by extraordinary circumstances including damage from fighting fires, resistance to arrest or other unusual circumstances incurred in the line of duty.
- 2. The City of Manistee will continue to pay full cost of employees and dependents Blue-Cross Blue-Shield Insurance.
- 3. The City of Manistee will increase life insurance coverage from \$2,000.00 to \$5,000.00.
- 4. The City of Manistee will pay shift premiums as follows, retroactive to July 1, 1970:

5¢ 3 P.M. to 11 P.M. 10¢ 11 P.M. to 7 A.M. 10¢ 9 P.M. to 5 A.M.

5. The City of Manistee will pay overtime at the rate of time and one-half effective 10/1/70. Delegate Lindeman dissenting on basis retroactive to 7/1/70 should prevail.

6. The City of Manistee will grant a 14% wage increase effective July 1, 1970. The contract shall run through June 30, 1972 with a general wage reopener. at the end of the first year. The contract shall be reopenable by either party for this item by notice of either party to the other not less than 60 days prior to the annual budget meeting of the City Council and the City Manager shall notify the Police Officers Association of the date of the annual budget meeting 70 days prior to such meeting.

WILLIS: A. REINKE
IMPARTIAL CHAIRMAN

WILLIAM A. LINDEMAN
POLICE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION DELEGATE

CITY OF MANISTEE DELEGATE